

UNDERSTANDING WRONGFUL CONVICTION

*The protection of the innocent
across Europe and America*

Edited by

LUCA LUPÁRIA

 Wolters Kluwer

CEDAM

2015

PROPRIETÀ LETTERARIA RISERVATA

Copyright 2015 Wolters Kluwer Italia Srl

I diritti di traduzione, di memorizzazione elettronica, di riproduzione e di adattamento totale o parziale, con qualsiasi mezzo (compresi i microfilm e le copie fotostatiche), sono riservati per tutti i Paesi.

Le fotocopie per uso personale del lettore possono essere effettuate nei limiti del 15% di ciascun volume/fascicolo di periodico dietro pagamento alla SIAE del compenso previsto dall'art. 68, commi 4 e 5 della legge 22 aprile 1941, n. 633.

Le riproduzioni diverse da quelle sopra indicate (per uso non personale – cioè, a titolo esemplificativo, commerciale, economico o professionale – e/o oltre il limite del 15%) potranno avvenire solo a seguito di specifica autorizzazione rilasciata da EDISER Srl, società di servizi dell'Associazione Italiana Editori, attraverso il marchio CLEARedi Centro Licenze e Autorizzazioni Riproduzioni Editoriali. Informazioni: www.clearedi.org.

L'elaborazione dei testi, anche se curata con scrupolosa attenzione, non può comportare specifiche responsabilità per eventuali involontari errori o inesattezze.

Stampato in Italia - Printed in Italy

Stampato da GECA s.r.l. - Via Monferrato, 54 - 20098 San Giuliano Milanese (MI)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

RETHINKING THE APPROACH TO WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN EUROPE: SOME PRELIMINARY REMARKS

Luca Lupária

..... pag. 1

PART I

MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE: CRITICAL ISSUES AND NEW CHALLENGES IN AMERICA AND EUROPE

CHAPTER I

THE HUMAN FACTOR IN WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS ACROSS NATIONAL BORDERS

Mark Godsey

1. Introduction	pag.	13
2. Confirmation bias and faulty forensic conclusions.....	»	16
3. Memory problems, eyewitness identification and false confessions	»	24
4. Lie detection, tunnel vision and police/prosecutor misconduct.....	»	30
5. Conclusion.....	»	32

CHAPTER II

INNOCENCE WORK IN THE AMERICAS

Justin Brooks

1. Introduction	pag.	33
2. The challenges	»	34
3. The future	»	36

CHAPTER III

ACCOUNTING FOR THE POTENTIAL
OF ERROR IN THE EVALUATION OF THE WEIGHT
OF SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE*J. Vuille, A. Biedermann, F. Taroni*

1.	Introduction	pag.	39
2.	Erroneous scientific evidence.....	»	40
3.	Uncertainty in forensic science.....	»	44
4.	Uncertainty in the evaluation of forensic findings: the role of probability and Bayesian inference.....	»	45
5.	Interpreting scientific evidence with Bayes' Theorem: the example of forensic DNA evidence.....	»	48
	5.1. An introduction to forensic DNA analysis	»	48
	5.2. Probabilistic evaluation of DNA profiling results	»	50
	5.3. Probabilistic evaluation of DNA profiling results and the potential of error.....	»	52
6.	Conclusion.....	»	55

CHAPTER IV

WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS
AS A RESULT OF POLITICAL PRESSURE*Martin Killias*

1.	Wrongful convictions: an American subject?	pag.	57
2.	Factors that increase risk of miscarriages of justice	»	59
3.	Almost forgotten: "intentional" miscarriages of justice	»	62
4.	Outreau and DSK: two cases in France	»	64
5.	The Torino Eternit trial: an emblematic case.....	»	65
	5.1. The background.....	»	65
	5.2. The defendant and asbestos.....	»	67
	5.3. Reactions to a tragedy of huge dimensions	»	70
	5.4. Confusing legal technicalities.....	»	71
	5.5. Distorting facts	»	75
	5.6. The <i>Deus ex machina</i> : the Supreme Court.....	»	77
	5.7. Not over yet.....	»	78
6.	Preventing and remedying abusive trials.....	»	79

PART II
WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN EUROPE:
PREVENTION AND REMEDIES

CHAPTER V

THE EMERGING PHENOMENON OF WRONGFUL
CONVICTIONS IN THE NETHERLANDS:
CAUSES AND SOLUTIONS

G.G.J. Knoops, E.L.I. Bell

1.	Introduction	pag.	83
2.	Identifying the number of wrongful convictions	»	86
	2.1. Introduction: comparative issues	»	86
	2.2. Wrongful conviction ‘crimes’	»	87
3.	Reopening criminal cases within the Dutch criminal justice system	»	89
	3.1. Introduction	»	89
	3.2. The law on redressing miscarriages of justice	»	89
	3.3. The ACAS system	»	95
4.	Causes of wrongful convictions	»	98
	4.1. False confessions and true denials	»	99
	4.2. Forensic errors	»	103
5.	The inquisitorial justice system and its impact upon miscarriages of justice	»	105
6.	Conclusions and recommendations	»	109

CHAPTER VI

MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE AND AWARENESS
OF THE ITALIAN JUDGE

Giuseppe Gennari

1.	Premises	pag.	111
2.	The inertia effect on wrongful convictions	»	112
3.	What can we do in Italy to protect innocent people?	»	114

CHAPTER VII

REMEDIES FOR MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE IN ITALY

Mitja Gialuz

1.	Introduction	pag.	117
2.	Revision as main mechanism of reparation for miscarriage of justice	»	121

3.	The exclusion of partial revision	pag.	124
4.	The scope of application of revision.....	»	125
5.	Revision and new scientific evidence.....	»	128
6.	Compensation for miscarriage of justice	»	133

Chapter VIII

WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN THE FRENCH CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM: SOME CONSIDERATION

Sylvain Cormier

1.	Introduction	pag.	137
2.	The revisions obtained before the law of 20 June 2014.	»	140
3.	Since the law of 20 June 2014: the Machin case	»	142

PART III

THE EXPERIENCE OF THE INNOCENCE PROJECTS IN EUROPE

CHAPTER IX

THE COMMON VOCABULARY OF INNOCENCE: INTERNATIONALIZATION OF THE INNOCENCE NETWORK AS A HUMAN RIGHTS ORGANISATION

David Langwallner

1.	By way of an introduction	pag.	149
2.	Local differences	»	151
3.	What then do we have in common?.....	»	153
4.	Students: embedded learning and human right consciousness	»	158
5.	Conclusions	»	161

CHAPTER X

THE UK INNOCENCE MOVEMENT: PAST, PRESENT, AND FUTURE?

Holly Greenwood

1.	Introduction	pag.	163
2.	The UK innocence movement: the background	»	164
3.	Research summary.....	»	169

TABLE OF CONTENTS

IX

4.	The UK innocence movement: an overview.....	pag.	170
4.1.	Limitations of the innocence project model	»	170
4.2.	Systemic problems	»	176
5.	A view to the future.....	»	183
6.	Conclusion.....	»	191

CHAPTER XI

WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN POLAND
AND THE POLISH INNOCENT PROGRAM

Maria Ejchart – Dubois

1.	Introduction	pag.	193
2.	Empowerments and major activity of Innocence Clinic	»	194
3.	Causes of miscarriage of justice	»	197
3.1.	Scene examination.....	»	198
3.2.	Identification parade and incorrect identification by a witness	»	199
3.3.	Admission of guilty	»	201
3.4.	Expert witness	»	202
3.5.	False accusation.....	»	204
4.	Summary	»	206

CHAPTER XII

WORKING WITH STUDENTS IN INNOCENCE
EFFORTS: MERITS AND CHALLENGES

Martina Cagossi

1.	Premises.....	pag.	207
2.	Clinical legal education in United States and Europe....	»	208
3.	The benefits from working in an innocence project law clinic	»	213
4.	The Italy Innocence Project.....	»	216

PART IV
MISCARRIAGES OF JUSTICE
UNDER A SOUTH AMERICAN PERSPECTIVE

CHAPTER XIII

WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN CHILE:
 CHALLENGES FOR THE NEW
 CRIMINAL PROCEDURE

A. Alvarado Urizar, I. Castillo Val

1.	Introduction	pag. 221
2.	The origin of concern for the wrongfully convicted people: identifying the problem and its causes	» 224
3.	The Chilean experience on wrongful convictions	» 225
3.1.	Criminal procedure reform: from an inquisitorial procedure to an adversarial design ..	» 225
3.2.	Brief analysis of the effective progress of the reform	» 227
3.3.	The role of precedents in general	» 229
3.4.	Role of appeals for review before the Supreme Court.....	» 230
4.	The conviction of innocent defendants in the new Chilean criminal procedure: selected case analysis	» 236
4.1.	The Lobos Parra case	» 237
4.1.1.	Analysis of the trial and conviction of the V Oral Criminal Court of Santiago ..	» 237
4.1.2.	The Police's tunnel vision.....	» 238
4.1.3.	The state prosecution's tunnel vision	» 239
4.1.4.	The court's tunnel vision	» 240
4.1.5.	Analysis of the appeal for review and the Supreme Court's decision	» 244
4.2.	The Robles Vergara case.....	» 247
4.2.1.	The case and the trial court's decision analysis and the appeal for annulment ...	» 247
4.2.2.	Appeal for review and the Supreme Court decision's analysis	» 255
5.	Conclusions	» 257